Knowledge Development of Spiritual Resilience Concepts Faced During the Covid-19 Pandemic in Meta-Analysis

Mahsa Amira Anindya Najib
Universitas Indonesia

Sri Sarjana
Politeknik Transportasi Darat Indonesia – STTD
srisarjana@gmail.com

Nur Khayati
SMA Negeri 1 Cikarang Utara

Abstract

Spiritual resilience is ability to carry out the teachings of religion adopted by implementing religious values as the basis for acting and behaving. The ability in attitude and behavior in implementing religious teachings becomes a solid foundation in dealing with various life problems in order to get the best solution in accordance with God's teachings. Qualitative methods by implementing meta-analysis are applied to this study as an effort to analyze topics studied in various scientific journals. Scientific literature is analyzed over a period of time during covid-19 pandemic on the topic of spiritual resilience. The results of meta-analysis describe various current topics and deserve to be developed in the future in increasing knowledge related to spiritual resilience with several dominant topics including efficacy, religious coping, psychological hardiness, spiritual wellbeing, spiritual intelligent, psychological capital, spiritual change, spiritual influence, emotional intelligence. The various topics studied were found to have novel value and need to be further developed to grow knowledge in order to face various problems and challenges in the future which are expected to be in accordance with the needs in providing solutions to various problems that arise.

Keywords: spiritual resilience; knowledge development; meta-analysis; bibliometric analysis; covid-19

Introduction

The development of concept for spiritual resilience in various parts of the world in last two years has become the focus of public attention in religious learning. Spiritual resilience has a balance with psychological conditions so that spiritual resilience increases along with better psychological person (Kwok et al., 2020), developed through the distribution of positive messages and is possible in the form of rewards, sharing success stories, and helping to balance expectations with reality (Dewey et al., 2020), the emergence of spiritual resilience begins with life transformation in order to improve self-awareness and self-understanding (Holly Nelson-Becker & Thomas, 2020). The theme of spiritual resilience which is applied in the study through an investigation process of various efforts in developing spiritual values in order to face the covid-19 pandemic
which is still happening all over the world which must be addressed immediately in order to reduce the number of fatalities and prepare to improve healthy living behaviors in daily activities. However, many aspects related to spiritual resilience have been studied in various researches, but the importance of developing in understanding spiritual resilience through direct and continuous practice must continue to be cultivated which is expected to improve spiritual health. Efforts to strengthen spiritual resilience still face many problems as evidenced by previous research, including spiritual resilience is used as a protective factor to reduce the risk of suicide (Reed & Adams, 2020), able to awaken inner strength to form adaptive coping mechanism (Ilievska & Ilievski, 2020), able to eliminate stress and reduce psychological suffering (Davis et al., 2021) (Chirico & Nucera, 2020).

Several solutions to strengthen spiritual resilience in the face of pandemic have been presented in many studies to help improve spiritual health, including that religious spiritual practices are carried out in the form of prayer and fasting as a belief system in dealing with various life difficulties through inspiration including sharing behavior, helping others, and having more patience (Munawaroh et al., 2021), efforts to improve spirituality are implemented through the practice of reciting shalawat found in mysticism which is part of community belief (Mujib et al., 2021), solutions and answers holistically to overcome various mental health problems, especially if it is associated with spiritual resilience, which is felt to be more effective when applying the Qur'an and Sunnah in daily life (Hassan, 2021). However, the partial solution presented in its development is similar to what has been done in several countries including Italy, Canada, USA, and Indonesia so that more complex solutions are still needed to solve existing problems. The unique treatment of each country has been given as step to develop spiritual resilience. However, an approach by suggesting new strategies is needed for the development of knowledge associated with spiritual resilience to maintain good health. The hope of developing a new strategy is to expand the diversity of knowledge so that new concepts are obtained through the search for relevant scientific journals. The relevance of knowledge formulated in this study, especially on the concept of spiritual resilience, is expected to improve the quality of mental health and be useful for improving the quality of research that is more complex and diverse.

Spiritual resilience has been widely presented in various applied studies that support the importance of every human being to worship according to their religion which can have an impact on the better spiritual health of each ummah. Therefore, advanced studies in discussing spiritual resilience are important studies and need to be deepened in order to obtain new concept, this is reinforced by several previous studies including that spiritual resilience plays an important role in building resilience by strengthening a sense of collective identity and social cohesion, while also accelerating the healing process and post-disaster recovery individually and communally (Lalani et al., 2021), spiritual resilience serves to relieve spiritual suffering, including meaninglessness which is defined as a feeling of being disconnected from God (Jung-Yeon, 2021), be grown through religious learning which is expected to bring about positive changes in life behavior (HNelson-Becker, 2018), spiritual resilience encourages drug abuse prevention through support from family and friends (Firdaus et al., 2019), reduces the negative effects on traumatic events done by praying as a spiritual routine (Jaeger et al., 2021), spirituality is used to increase resilience and is felt to be able to overcome various difficulties in navigating life (Manning et al., 2019). The deepening of spiritual resilience is expected to be able to create a more diverse concept of spirituality with the uniqueness and peculiarities that are owned in various parts of the world, which can be done by praying, shalawat, and applying the Qur'an and Sunnah in daily behavior. However, innovation and diversity of knowledge that is developed more deeply in spiritual resilience needs to be carried out more complexly in many fields so that the new concepts obtained from the
study results can be fully accepted and useful by the public. For this reason, a more in-depth elaboration of the concept of spiritual resilience applied in this study aims to identify and disseminate it more broadly referring to topics that are suitable for research development. Monitoring scientific evolution through meta-analysis of the concept of spiritual resilience is able to present trends in latest research that needs to be developed further in order to provide more specific understanding. The new topic as result of scientific studies reveals some of latest issues that need to be followed up in strengthening the quality of worship in order to get closer to God.

Methods

The development of diversity in the form of the evolution of knowledge is presented in mapping with the topic of spiritual resilience as goal that is expected to be achieved in the study, especially during the Covid-19 pandemic in order to strengthen the mental health of community. Scientific journals as the main source to obtain data based on research topics that are studied with focus on spiritual resilience through the expansion of scientific literature are applied with qualitative methods. Bibliometric analysis is method for analyzing evolutionarily large amounts of scientific data (Donthu et al., 2021), powerful tool for studying specific research topics analyzing citations, geographic distributions and co-citations (Gallego-Losada et al., 2021), used in various disciplines and to analyze research trends (Jiang et al., 2021). The identification of the latest trends on the topic of spiritual resilience needs to be monitored by utilizing scientific evolution to find out the latest issues needed for future knowledge development. Knowledge development needs to be done that is focused on new issues that are raised in supporting community resilience that are associated with spiritual behavior in daily life patterns that can have an impact on mental health during global pandemic. For this reason, it is hoped that the application of evolution for knowledge in scientific journals can contribute positively in strengthening the mental health of community through improving behavior in carrying out spiritual activities that are getting stronger in getting closer to worshiping God.

Search results of scientific journals so as to obtain research data which is then analyzed using VOSviewer to get visualization of display results that are attractive and easy to understanding. VOSviewer is implemented to support distribution analysis of journal publications, authors, affiliations and widely cited papers (Hamidah et al., 2021), used to evaluate trending and popular research topics (Chen et al., 2021). Research data on the topic of spiritual resilience has been systematically collected from many journal articles during September 2021. The time span used for searching in obtaining scientific journals according to topics on specificity during pandemic takes place in 2020-2021, although in 2021 it is not fully traced. Primary data collected amounted to 1963 scientific journals obtained from the results of search for spiritual resilience as key word entered. Time clustering was prepared in the last two years according to the time of global pandemic. The clustering carried out is directed to facilitate the analysis of topics that have novelty which are expected to help in improving the mental health of community during pandemic and preparing themselves to deal with post-pandemic situations and conditions. The latest issues that have been generated should be investigated and explored at an advanced level in order to assist community in improving mental health through strengthening spiritual resilience so that pandemic will soon pass and the implementation of spirituality practices can be improved better.

Results
Knowledge development is described in the form of network visualization and density visualization in explaining the concept of spiritual resilience. Spiritual resilience is explored as keyword in scientific journal searches which is used as primary data for further analysis. Scientific journals on the topic of spiritual resilience that were obtained in the search amounted to 1963 journal articles in the time span of scientific journals published between 2020-2021. Although the publication time only lasted for two years, maybe even less, 6857 citations have been obtained. This indicates that scientific journals that have been published for two years on the concept of spiritual resilience have been widely used for knowledge development as an effort to encourage mental health strengthening in the face of global pandemic. Visualization results in the form of networks and density are presented through analysis using the VOSviewer application.

Table 1. Spiritual resilience specification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Papers</td>
<td>971</td>
<td>992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citations</td>
<td>5536</td>
<td>1321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cites/year</td>
<td>5536.00</td>
<td>1321.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cites/paper</td>
<td>5.70</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors/paper</td>
<td>2.65</td>
<td>2.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h-index</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g-index</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hA-index</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The classification is based on two years of searching scientific journals on the topic of spiritual resilience, especially to find out the number of scientific articles, citation information and indexes obtained. Information on the number of citations and average obtained can be seen in 2021 there is decrease because publication time has not been long compared to previous year. This also occurs in index value category obtained so that scientific journals need longer time for publication to be better known by researchers or academics, and it is hoped that they can be promoted using well-known journal publishers to increase the number of citations in short time. For this reason, high number of citations is needed which indicates the growing use of scientific journals for the development of knowledge, especially on the topic of spiritual resilience.

Table 2. Cluster of spiritual resilience 2020-2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Community resilience, family resilience, empowerment, social capital, palliative care</td>
<td>Emotional resilience, death anxiety, depressive symptom, life satisfaction, mental distress, psychological hardiness, religious coping, spiritual development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural resilience, human resilience, spiritual distress, mental disorder</td>
<td>Emotional intelligence, adaptability, empowerment, family caregiver, spiritual dimension, traumatic experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Psychological distress, personality, death anxiety, spiritual coping</td>
<td>Moral distress, mental health problem, palliative care, personal resilience, positive psychology, religious belief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Constructive resilience, spiritual guidance, prayer, meditation,</td>
<td>Moral resilience, personality, physical health, spiritual value,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Building resilience, efficacy, commitment therapy, psychological capital, spiritual wellbeing, Emotional intelligence, resilience strategy, spiritual development, transformation, Personal strength, spiritual change, spiritual resource, post traumatic growth, academic stress, Confidence, inner peace, leadership, spiritual leadership, hardiness, Change, personal competence, positive acceptance, spiritual influence, tenacity, trust

Community resilience, disaster resilience, religiousness, social capital, spiritual intervention, Personal competence, positive acceptance, spiritual influence, tenacity, tolerance, trust, Spiritual change, positive change, personal strength, new possibility, post traumatic growth, Efficacy, psychological capital, stress full situation, prayer, patience, Cultural identity, poverty, psychological distress, religious, psychological distress, religious, spiritual coping, spiritual resource, work engagement

The latest issues can be raised through new clusters on the topic of spiritual resilience published in scientific journals to answer current knowledge needs. New issues found in scientific journal studies in the last two years are sought for the development of advanced knowledge on the topic of spiritual resilience which presented in nine clusters. The topics that have important novelties to be developed further in this research include emotional resilience, cultural resilience, psychological distress, constructive resilience, community resilience, emotional intelligence, and spiritual change. Some of issues generated in the clustering can be used as studies for the evolution of knowledge at an advanced level for the development of knowledge and benefits for community in improving mental health during pandemic.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TC</th>
<th>APY</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Source Journal</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>145</td>
<td>145.0</td>
<td>A cross-sectional study on mental health among health care workers during the outbreak of Corona Virus Disease 2019</td>
<td>Asian journal of psychiatry</td>
<td>W Cai, B Lian, X Song, T Hou, G Deng, H Li</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>135</td>
<td>135.0</td>
<td>Clinician wellness during the COVID-19 pandemic: extraordinary times and unusual challenges for the allergist/immunologist</td>
<td>The Journal of Allergy and Clinical Immunology: InPractice</td>
<td>P Bansal, TA Bingemann, M Greenhawt S Khan, R Siddique, H Li, A Ali, MA Shereen</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>133</td>
<td>133.0</td>
<td>Impact of coronavirus outbreak on psychological health</td>
<td>Journal of Global Health</td>
<td></td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>129</td>
<td>129.0</td>
<td>Psychological health during the coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic outbreak</td>
<td>International Journal of Social Psychiatry</td>
<td>S Mukhtar</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows the number of citations, average citations, and index values in top ten scientific journals published in the last two years. Exposure to the number of citations has an assessment that is not high due to short publication period so that scientific journals published in 2020 seem to dominate compared to journal publications in following year. To obtain the optimal number of citations, it is necessary to have superior article quality through the novelty produced and value of its benefits for the development of knowledge. For this reason, the novelty obtained in research is vital matter, let alone being able to provide positive benefits that can help in solving various problems that occur in community, especially being able to help overcome pandemic problems, including improving mental health through strengthening spiritual resilience.

Table 4. Ranked in the top ten scientific journals 2020-2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Source Journal</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>TC</th>
<th>AP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>S Duran, D Avci, F Esim</td>
<td>Association between spiritual well-being and resilience among Turkish hemodialysis patients</td>
<td>Journal of religion and health</td>
<td>Springer</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>V Counted, MA Neff, LE Captari</td>
<td>Transcending place attachment disruptions during a public health crisis: Spiritual struggles, resilience, and transformation</td>
<td>Journal of Psychology &amp; Christianity</td>
<td>Christian Association for Psychological Studies</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>MA Besharat, S Ramesh</td>
<td>The relation between resilience, spiritual well-being and post-traumatic growth in disaster-exposed organizations: overview of the literature</td>
<td>BMJ Mil Health</td>
<td>RS Fernández, L Crivelli, NM Guimet, RF Allegri</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Psychological distress associated with COVID-19 quarantine: Latent profile analysis, outcome prediction and mediation analysis</td>
<td>Journal of Affective Disorders</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Impacts of COVID-19 pandemic on urban park visitation: a global analysis</td>
<td>Journal of forestry research</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>COVID-19, mental health, and religious coping among American Orthodox Jews</td>
<td>Journal of Religion and Health</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Maintaining health and well-being by putting faith into action during the COVID-19 pandemic</td>
<td>Journal of religion and health</td>
<td>HG Koenig</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
being, and social support with adjustment to heart disease

4 HG Koenig
Maintaining health and well-being by putting faith into action during the COVID-19 pandemic
Exercising the Effectiveness of WhatsApp-Based Spiritual
Journal of Medical Sciences
Springer 2020 67 67.0 0

5 SP Pandya
Maintaining health and well-being by putting faith into action during the COVID-19 pandemic
Exercising the Effectiveness of WhatsApp-Based Spiritual
Journal of Medical Sciences
Springer 2020 67 67.0 0

6 FD Schwalm, RB Zandavalli
Examining the Effectiveness of WhatsApp-Based Spiritual
Journal of Medical Sciences
Springer 2020 67 67.0 0

7 P Chavapatnakul, T Wongkumis in
The Relationship between Resilience Quotient, Social Support and Spiritual Well-Being of Caregivers of Patients with Hemiplegia
Siriraj Medical Journal
The Official Journal of Faculty of Medicine Siriraj Hospital 2020 1 0 0.00

8 H Nilsson
Spiritual Self-Care Management for Nursing Professionals: A Holistic Approach
Journal of Holistic Nursing
Sage Publication 2020 1 0 0.00

9 A Razaghpoo r, H Rafiei, F Taqavi
Resilience and its relationship with spiritual wellbeing among patients with heart failure
British Journal of Cardiac Nursing
The Official Journal of Faculty of Medicine Siriraj Hospital 2020 1 0 0.00

10 HJ Burnett Jr, J Jaeger, K Witzel
Spiritual Well-Being-A Proactive Resilience Component: Exploring its Relationship with Practices, Themes, and other Psychological Well-being Factors
Crisis, Stress, and Human Resilience
Scholastica 2020 1 0 0.00

Scientific journals that are included in top ten rankings shown in table 4 explain that year of publication is divided equally even though the number of citations obtained is still small and some even have not received citations. For this reason, short publication time causes the number of citations obtained to be small so that in addition to the quality of articles that must be improved, it is also necessary to publish scientific journals to publishers that are already popular so that they are better known by academics and researchers who can be used as references for further research. The novelty produced in scientific journal writing is one indicator that states the quality of publication so that usually large number of citations will be obtained if novelty possessed can be referenced and utilized according to the needs of community.
Scientific journals published 2020-2021 are presented in the pattern of network visualization and density visualization on the topic of spiritual resilience which is shown in Figure 1 as a result for the analysis of studies that have been carried out. The relationship between topics studied is displayed in the form of visualization connected between nodes according to their respective colors. Connections through lines between existing nodes indicate a direct relationship to topic being studied. Nodes that are displayed in round shape with certain size indicate the number of topics studied in scientific journals. While the nodes depicted with a certain color indicate that round nodes with same color are in the same cluster, which means that topics studied also have similarities. The color brightness category displayed on density visualization indicates trending topic and is widely studied in scientific journals at the time of publication when researched. The trending research topic shown in Figure 1 explains that spiritual influence, emotional intelligence, spiritual change, and meditation have better node sizes and color brightness levels than others. Some topics that are trending and can be followed up on to be further developed on the concept of spiritual resilience in scientific evolution or can even be expanded to new topics that are still rarely studied include psychological capital and posttraumatic growth.
The visualization presented in Figure 2 in the form of a network and density explains that care, change, efficacy, and spiritual intelligence are main focuses studied on spiritual resilience in 2020. The four topics that are main focus are described as having larger node sizes and having higher levels for the brightness of color is clearer so that it is widely studied by academics and researchers in that year. However, there are still several new topics that have not been widely studied and have opportunities to be developed in further research including psychological distress, resilience strategy, and psychosocial factors.
The topic of spiritual resilience 2021 which is presented in the form of visualization for the network and density shown in Figure 3 explains that there are several topics that are trending and are widely researched including change, posttraumatic growth, burnout, and efficacy. In addition to these four topics having larger node size than the others, they also have a clearer level of color brightness so that many studies utilize this variable and focus on research towards this topic that can be developed in the concept of spiritual resilience. However, there are other topics that should be developed for further research including palliative care, spiritual experience, spiritual resources, and religious coping.

Conclusions
Exploration of community mental health in the face of global pandemic can be done through the development of spiritual resilience as part of knowledge development which is an important need at this time. The development of knowledge on the topic of spiritual resilience needs to be continued as an effort to expand the diversity of new issues that develop in order to obtain new research needed to strengthen the spiritual values of community in improving the quality of worship. The results of study stated that the topic of spiritual resilience published in scientific journals 2020-2021 described several new topics that were found including efficacy, religious coping, psychological hardiness, spiritual wellbeing, spiritual intelligent, psychological capital, spiritual change, spiritual influence, and emotional intelligence. Even though if viewed from the number of citations it has not been obtained in large numbers, the potential possessed by scientific journals published in last two years has a good chance of getting attention for researchers and academics because there is novelty value that can be followed up for knowledge development. For this reason, the topic of spiritual resilience has an important role in the development of scientific evolution, especially in revealing new topics according to the concepts being studied in order to increase the value of spirituality in the face of pandemic. Attractive views displayed in network and density visualization show relationship between topics making it easier to analyze and understand the goals to be achieved. Further research related to the concept of spiritual resilience needs to be investigated further by utilizing new techniques and methods to obtain novelties that cannot be obtained in this study.

References
https://doi.org/10.1007/s10943-020-01036-1


